

CSUG Meeting, 11:00-13:00, 12 March 2019

Room D, London Nobel House, Defra

MINUTES

1. Welcome & introductions

Elaine Kendall welcomed the attendees. The list of attendees and apologies can be seen at the bottom of this document.

2. Agree minutes from December meeting & action point update

The minutes of the previous meeting were agreed. All previous action points were considered complete except for 1 and 5.

AP1 - Traders provided some information during the meeting on upcoming trade shows (e.g. Hamm reptile show in June, September and December) but the action point is to be carried over for any additional information on trade shows to be provided.

Action Point 1: Action point 1 from the previous meeting to be carried over - traders are invited to send any relevant information to Defra regarding trade shows; including specimens that might be transported and the associated quantities.

AP5 – Defra and APHA have not yet reviewed with legal advisors the requirement to return the yellow page of CITES Article 10 certificates to APHA. The problem was reiterated that many EU Member States will not accept photocopies of the yellow page and this causes major problems for animal traders in the EU. Other member states use specimen specific certificates. The UK interpretation of the regulations is that a transaction specific certificate is for one transaction not multiple transactions.

Action Point 2: Defra to raise with other EU Member States at the next CITES EU Management Committee meeting if possible.

3. Corporate update

APHA - APHA recruitment is nearly complete. 20 new case officers and 3 new team leaders have been recruited so far. Teams have been reorganised into six teams each headed by a team leader. A new telephone system has been added to the old system to help manage calls.

Defra CITES team – Caroline Daisley has joined the team as a Senior Policy Advisor and another Policy Advisor will be starting soon. Kris Blake (KB) has been promoted and is now working on CITES EU Exit work with Clare Richmond and Sam Lightwing. Elaine Kendall (EK) reported that she has also been promoted and will be leaving the CITES Team soon, replacement to be announced.

Defra EU Exit team – Sally Cunningham's team has recruited additional staff with Faye Purdon supporting Rhiannon Hudson-Jones on borders and legislation issues, Emma Taylor working with Paul Bleazard and Raphael Dapaah on stakeholder engagement and Maya Moss supporting the team.

JNCC and Kew have also recruited additional people to help deal with the larger case load.

Given the numerous staff changes a list of key people was requested so that traders know who to contact.

Action Point 3: Defra to circulate team organograms and key contact details.

4. UK and International Meetings:

(i) Review of 86th Meeting of the Scientific Review Group, 11th Feb 2019;

JNCC / Kew indicated that much of the meeting was dedicated to discussing CITES 18th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP18) proposals. There was also discussion around eels and the UK's non detrimental finding. The EU is not prepared to take any decision on this at this stage.

(ii) Review of 85th Management Committee & 14th Expert Group, 12th Feb 2019;

KB reported that much of the day was spent discussing CoP18 proposals. An update was given on the proposal for the EU ivory ban which will be discussed further at a technical meeting on 27 March.

(iii) Review of Working Party on International Environmental Issues (WPIEI) (CITES) meeting, 18th February 2019;

EK stated that the EU positions on CoP18 proposals were discussed at this meeting. Some CoP18 documents are still to come forward e.g. big cats and rhinos. There will be another WPIEI on 28 March to discuss positions further.

5. Upcoming 18th Conference of the Parties (CoP18):

- **UK delegation and side events**

EK reported that the UK delegation is still under discussion but will include members of the Defra CITES Team, a lawyer, colleagues from the scientific authorities and Border Force.

The UK intends to run an illegal wildlife trade side event titled 'Assessing the progress and evidence base on tackling Illegal Wildlife Trade globally.' Interpol is running a 3 day Wildlife Crime working group and ZSL might be hosting an eel side event which JNCC would be involved with.

- **UK / EU CoP18 positions**

EK invited comments on any of the CoP18 proposals. A question was asked over what the EU are thinking and JNCC explained that working groups had been set up to consider all the issues. The UK is represented on all working groups which are trying to agree positions that will go to WPIEI. Some positions are agreed and others have been left open pending consultation with range states and stakeholders. More scientific analysis is required in some cases.

There is still an opportunity to influence decisions on the ones that are still open. EK asked for comments now as positions are being prepared for WPIEI on 28 March. The UK positions on mammoth, *Boswellia* and *Cedrela* were queried. The UK is not supportive of the proposal to list mammoth given that mammoths are an extinct species. The UK is supportive of the draft decisions proposed for *Boswellia* spp. as more information is needed. The UK is also in favour of the proposal

to include *Cedreia* spp. in Appendix II as long as an annotation is included to restrict CITES controls to certain products.

A separate meeting was requested before WPIEI to discuss specific CoP18 proposals. The following items were flagged for discussion:

Action Point 4: Paul McManus to check on the use of *Cedreia* in guitars and Mark Dodgson to check on its use in antiques and feedback findings to Defra.

Ornamental Aquatic Trade Association (OATA) – Documents 10 (CITES Strategic Vision post 2020), 12 (Securing better implementation of marine fish species listings in the Appendices), 17 (Rural communities), 18 (CITES and livelihoods), 33 (Combatting wildlife cybercrime)

Sustainable Users Network (SUN) – Query over the St Vincent and the Grenadines proposal (CoP18 Prop 29) to list *Gonatodes daudini* (Grenadines clawed gecko) on Appendix I and the Sri Lanka and USA proposal (CoP18 Prop 46) to list *Poecilotheria* spp. (Ornamental spiders) on Appendix II.

- **Recording of newly listed/proposed CITES Appendix I species**

Jim Collins explained that at the last CoP APHA held a list of people that owned species before they were listed that were going to be placed on Appendix I. Chris Newman wanted to know if there was a possibility of doing the same for the species proposed for Appendix I at CoP18, i.e. a mechanism for people to register what they have before they are listed. EK confirmed that a new registration system will not be created and JNCC explained that it is not as simple as showing that a specimen was owned before the listing comes into effect as the owner needs to be able to show that a specimen was legally acquired.

Action Point 5: Defra, JNCC and APHA to discuss options.

6. Updates:

(i) Ivory ban & UK ivory controls

- **Registration process and costs**

It was confirmed that the registration system is being developed with users in mind and will be simple to complete. Defra will be consulting, formally and informally, in due course.

Stakeholders asked what documents musicians will need for travelling with elephant ivory tipped bows to use for playing (not selling). APHA confirmed that they will need a Musical Instrument Certificate (MIC).

A query was raised on the consultation for other ivory bearing species. Defra is preparing a call for evidence on other ivory species to be issued in Spring 2019.

- **Musical instrument certificates (MIC)**

MICs currently last for 3 years and stakeholders asked if they could be extended to a 10 year document. EK said that this is something that Defra could look at in the future.

A query was raised over MICs and how they will work after 29 March. APHA confirmed that MICs will still be used as currently is the case after 29 March.

Jenny Lomas raised a specific query regarding orchestras going on tour in Europe in March and how they travel back after 29 March if the Eurostar is not a designated port. Simon Woods agreed to discuss this further with Jenny outside the meeting.

(ii) Rosewood, *Dalbergia* listing & annotations

The EU and Canada has put a proposal to CoP18 regarding Annotation #15 to the *Dalbergia* listing. If adopted by CoP18 this would mean the exemption of finished musical instruments, parts of instruments and finished musical accessories. A further exemption would be for finished items weighing 500g or less.

There was a query over how 500g would be assessed. KB said that this will be discussed at CoP and that the proposal may need further refinement.

(iii) COTES

Civil sanctions are not yet in place as a public consultation has not taken place. The consultation will cover who needs to put licence numbers on adverts.

7. Pilot study on real cost of wildlife crime (JNCC trade report)

JNCC's report on the real costs of wildlife crime has not been published yet.

Stakeholders have raised concerns regarding the coral trade values included in the UK wildlife trade report. JNCC has gone back to WCMC to ask them to check their calculations and it appears that there is a miscalculation. JNCC has taken the report off the website whilst this is being looked at.

8. Derogation for EC Regulation 1523/2007

Kim McDonald explained how EC Regulation 1523/2007 bans the placing on the market and the import to, or export from, the EU of cat and dog fur, and products containing such fur. This effects all taxidermy specimens (antique or modern) of domestic cats/dogs and also includes all species of *Felis silvestris*. The EC state that it is possible to apply a derogation in respect of taxidermy and education - but as such nobody (from 28 countries) has ever raised the point, so no derogation exists. Kim McDonald would like to know how they can get a derogation for taxidermy and education.

| |
|--|
| <p>Action Point 6: Defra to put Kim McDonald in touch with the policy team at Defra that deals with Regulation 1523/2007.</p> |
|--|

9. Permitting Issues

- A10 certificates and yellow pages

Covered under Item 2 above.

- Clarification on microchipping

Chris Newman queried the size at which tortoises should be microchipped. The Article 10 certificate says they have to be microchipped at 10cm but it can be done at 6cm. A trader has been told now that it is compulsory to get them chipped at 6cm.

Action Point 7: Chris Newman to provide details to Defra via the CITES MA mailbox (CITES.UKMA@defra.gov.uk).

- **A10s for registered sellers of dead birds (RSDB)**

In the 1980s and 1990s a scheme was in place for the registration of dead birds covered by the Wildlife and Countryside Act that were to be sold. The records for these specimens have been destroyed but many of the specimens still exist and in cases where traders apply for an A10 to sell such a specimen Defra may refuse to issue the A10 as there is no record of when the birds were registered.

APHA explained that due to the data protection act it was not possible to keep the information. Article 10 data can be held on APHA's Unicorn system for 20 years as some of the live specimens could live for 20 years. Peter Beare gave an example of some Brazil wood that he bought in the 1990s. Knowing that the A10 record would be destroyed after 20 years he took photos of the wood and sent a set to APHA to be stamped and sent back again. Old photographs of specimens can be useful as evidence if registration records are no longer available.

10. AOB and next meeting

- **Amendment to wording in warning letter to breeders**

APHA confirmed that this issue, raised at a previous meeting, has been dealt with.

| Attendees | Apologies |
|---|--------------------------------|
| Mark Dodgson (BADA) | John David (RHS) |
| Peter Beare (Beare Violins) | Caroline Rainsford (CTPA) |
| Paul McManus (MIA) | Clive Hayter (Kew) |
| Woods, Simon (APHA) | Sonia Dhanda' (Kew) |
| Nicholls, Francine (APHA) | Mike Moser (BFTA) |
| Anthea Webbern (APHA) | Ramir Rohgar (Imperial Caviar) |
| Abdullah Shalchi (APHA) | Valentina Vaglica' (Kew) |
| Sam Miller (Burberry) | Mike Gates (Owl Society) |
| Madeline Groves (FTS Botanics) | David Hopkins (TTF) |
| Elaine Kendall (Defra) | Stephen Beadle (IOA) |
| Elif Skinner (Defra) | Kirsten Pullen (BIAZA) |
| Kristopher Blake (Defra) | Elaine Hiskett (Caviar House) |
| Caroline Daisley (Defra) | Annalies Stevens (CHRISTIES) |
| Elizabeth Biott (Defra) | Denise Valin (Burberry) |
| Emma Taylor (Defra) | Doyle, Alejandro (DEFRA) |
| Faye Purdon (Defra) | Vin Flemming (JNCC) |
| Sally Cunningham (Defra) | Timothy Jameson (Covance) |
| Sam Lightwing (Defra) | Graham Irving (Hawk Board) |
| Paul Bleazard (Defra) | Bryan Carroll (Bristol Zoo) |
| Clare Richmond (Defra) | Sophie Bird (APHA) |
| Rhiannon Hudson-Jones (Defra) | Mark Pemberton (ABO) |
| Maya Moss (Defra) | |
| Kirk Leech (Eara) | |
| Carly Cowell (Kew) | |
| Alison Littlewood (JNCC) | |
| Drew Bain (Guild of Taxidermists) | |
| Jim Collins (SUN) | |
| Jemima Parry-Jones (ICBP) | |
| Grant Miller (Border Force) | |
| Louise Hubble (NWCUC) | |
| Jenny Lomas (ABO) | |
| Sarah Buchanan (Amati) | |
| Matt Wate (PRS Guitars) | |
| Chris Newman (Reptile & Exotic Pet Trade Association) | |
| Susan Curtis (Neal's Yard Remedies) | |
| Martin Jones (Falconry Online) | |
| Catherine Rutherford (FTS Botanics) | |
| Martyn Denney (Cyclamen Society) | |
| Mark Dodgson (BADA) | |
| Kim McDonald (The Guild of Taxidermists) | |
| Dominic Whitmee (Ornamental Aquatic Trade Association (OATA)) | |